
MEETING	SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE
DATE	23 OCTOBER 2006
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS KIRK (CHAIR), MERRETT (VICE-CHAIR), BLANCHARD, CUTHBERTSON, HYMAN AND LIVESLEY
APOLOGIES	COUNCILLOR HILL

22. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The Chair invited any declarations of interest from Members in relation to business on the agenda. No such declarations were made.

23. MINUTES

The Minutes of the last meeting of the Committee held on 25 September 2006 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chair, subject to Councillors Merrett and Blanchard votes being recorded against the decision to reject a review on topic no.121 (parking charges in York) on clarification that such formal request had been made.

24. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The Chair reported that no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme had been received.

25. REDUCING CARBON EMISSIONS FROM YORK'S PUBLIC SECTOR HOUSING - REPORT BACK ON IMPLICATIONS AND REVISED RECOMMENDATIONS [5.00PM-5.20PM]

Members considered the final report of the Ad-hoc Scrutiny Sub-Committee reviewing carbon emissions from York's public sector housing in the light of revised recommendations and comments on implications, following further officer consultation. The Head of Financial Services attended the meeting to respond to any questions relating to associated resource implications.

RESOLVED: That the final report and recommendations be now endorsed for submission to the Executive and the potential implications arising therefrom be noted.

26. GUIDANCE ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT - FINAL AD-HOC SCRUTINY SUB-COMMITTEE REPORT

Members considered the final report and recommendations of the Ad-hoc Scrutiny Sub-Committee reviewing 'Guidance on Sustainable Development'. Councillor Vassie, Chair of the Scrutiny Sub-Committee, attended the meeting to briefly outline the purpose of the review and

summarise the processes involved. He explained that Scrutiny Officers and Members had worked closely with colleagues in preparing the recommendations, including Building Control. Comments on resource implications potentially associated with those recommendations were also included within the final report.

Members discussed the final report and endorsed it for submission to the Executive, with some revisions to clarify understanding of recommendation 12 and to incorporate reference to the statutory consultation process on the Local Development Framework.

RESOLVED: That the final report and recommendations, as revised above, be endorsed for submission to the Executive in due course and any potential resource implications associated therewith, be noted. .

27. SCHEDULE OF REGISTERED SCRUTINY TOPICS - LOCAL TRANSPORT PLAN 2 (LTP2) AND TRAFFIC CONGESTION TOPICS

Members considered a report inviting them to consider further 2 registered scrutiny topics, deferred from the last meeting, in relation to Local Transport Plan (LTP) 2 (No. 139) and traffic congestion in York (No. 120). At the request of Members, the Executive Member for City Strategy attended the meeting to outline the processes involved and participation of Members in implementing LTP2 and determining the strategy. Councillor Simpson-Laing also attended the meeting, as the registering Member, to explain why she believed both topics should be subject to scrutiny review.

In the light of the comments made, Members had a full and wide-ranging discussion on the potential for reviewing either topic and in particular on a focussed review of traffic congestion. The possibility of specifically reviewing consultation processes was raised. The Head of Financial Services also referred to potential funding available to the Council aimed at specifically addressing how it dealt with congestion on roads.

Members agreed not to proceed with topic (No.139) on LTP2 and deferred final consideration of topic 120 on traffic congestion to the next meeting, to enable officers to report back with a potential remit and further information on the funding sources referred to by the Head of Financial Services.

RESOLVED: That (1) topic No. 139 (LTP2) be rejected; and
(2) a further report as outlined above be submitted to the next meeting in relation to topic No. 120 (traffic congestion)

[Councillors Blanchard and Merrett wished it to be recorded that they had voted against the motion to reject topic No. 139 (LTP2)]

28. WORK PLANNING & PROCESS MANAGEMENT FOR SCRUTINY REVIEWS

Members considered a report on further work undertaken to establish some eligibility criteria and processes for managing scrutiny reviews. Attached to the report were some proposed criteria and a flow chart setting out the stages involved in the processes.

A discussion was held about the proposed eligibility criteria and it was explained that, as a minimum, topics should comply with the proposed criterion on public interest and but otherwise should meet 3 of the criteria.

Councillor Merrett proposed and Councillor Blanchard seconded the following amendment to the motion to approve the criteria as drafted:

“That the proposed criteria be extended to include the following:

- (i) policy development/review within the next 15 months; and
- (ii) holding the Executive to account”

On being put to the vote, the above amendment was declared lost and the criteria and processes for managing scrutiny reviews were approved. The Chair suggested that the various scrutiny roles described in the criteria could, however, be amended to read ‘policy development *and review*’ and that was agreed.

RESOLVED: That the proposed eligibility criteria and processes for managing scrutiny reviews be approved, as annexed to the report, with the above slight revision.

29. REMIT FOR SCRUTINY REVIEW OF USE OF COUNCIL- OWNED LAND IN TANG HALL AREA

Members considered a report seeking approval to a proposed remit for the review, commissioned at the last meeting, relating to the ‘community use of Council owned land in the Tang Hall area’. The remit had been drafted following consultation with those Members who had registered the topic and with relevant Council Officers. In line with the constitutional responsibilities of Scrutiny Management Committee, Members were also asked to confirm the proposed proportionality of the agreed Ad-Hoc Scrutiny Sub-Committee.

RESOLVED: That the remit for the Tang Hall Ad-Hoc Scrutiny Sub-Committee be approved, as drafted, and the membership for the Sub-Committee be confirmed as being 3(Lib Dem): 2(Labour) to comply with proportionality, with the Chair being Councillor Looker.

30. UPDATE ON WORK OF HEALTH SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

Members received a report and an update at the meeting from the Chair of the Health Scrutiny Committee relating to progress on the review of the

North Yorkshire & York Primary Care Trust's financial recovery plan. He advised the Committee that Health Scrutiny would be looking at arrangements for community care next and potential dental care in the future.

RESOLVED: That the report and update given by the Chair of Health Scrutiny Committee be noted.

M Kirk, Chair

[The meeting started at 5:00 pm and finished at 7:30 pm